

University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
Senate Executive Committee
Minutes
September 15, 2014

Present: Chair Roy Campbell, Vice Chair Kim Graber, Abbas Aminmansour (via phone), Nicholas Burbules, John Hart, Matthew Hill, Calvin Lear, William Maher, Mary Mallory, Gay Miller, David O'Brien, Michael Sandretto, Kevin Seymour, Joyce Tolliver

Absent: Prasanta Kalita, Melissa Madsen

Guests: Chancellor Phyllis Wise, Provost and Vice chancellor for Academic Affairs Ilesanmi Adesida, Associate Chancellor Reginald Alston, Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs and Academic Policies Abbas Benmamoun, Equal Opportunity and Inclusion Committee Chair Harry Hilton, Faculty and Academic Staff Benefits Chair John Kindt, Campus Faculty Association representative Richard Laugesen, Professor in Anthropology Ellen Moodie, Institute for Genomic Biology Director Gene Robinson, Vice Provost for Undergraduate Education and Innovation Charles Tucker

Media: Daily Illini – Megan Jones, Inside Illinois – Mike Helenthal, News Gazette – Christine De Garennes

A regular meeting of the Senate Executive Committee (SEC) was called to order at 3:13 pm on Monday, September 15, 2014 in 232 English Building, with Chair Campbell presiding.

1. Introductions

Guests and SEC members were introduced.

2. Approval of Minutes

The minutes from August 25, 2014 were approved as amended.

3. Chair's Remarks

Chair Campbell noted that Illinois is a community and we have differences, but should not let the differences divide us. The community needs to come back together to continue with the business of the University and come together in the spirit of collegiality. Threats should not be tolerated. Campbell continued by giving the Wikipedia definition for "vote of no confidence"; the administrator is no longer fit to serve in his/her role and asks for the resignation of the administrator. Campbell asked that resolutions be worded carefully to ensure the intention is clear. Disagreeing with decisions is not a vote of no confidence. There are proper channels to convey disagreement in administrative decisions and claims of infringement of academic freedom. One good place is the Senate Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure (AFT).

Chair Campbell reminded all those present to be sure to complete the Illinois Open Meetings Act (OMA) online training if anyone has not done so.

Burbules felt there was a misunderstanding of the phrase "vote of no confidence" in some units. Burbules noted one unit that did not have the intention of voting that the Chancellor step-down. Robust discussions should be possible without calling for resignations. Lear agreed that people need to be clear on the exact meaning of their vote.

In response to a question, O'Brien noted a subcommittee of AFT members are reviewing the Salaita issue, and none of those subcommittee members have made a decision in support or against the hiring of Salaita. Once the report is reviewed by the full committee, there will be a footnote for those who have made their opinions public.

4. Chancellor's Remarks

Wise expressed her honor in serving as the Chancellor at Illinois. Wise apologized for failing to follow her usual process for communicating hiring decisions that she has followed in the past when hiring faculty. Professor Salaita was recruited by the American Indian Studies Program and approved by the Dean of the

College. Then sent on to the Office of the Provost and Office of the Chancellor. The recommendation to hire Salaita was not forwarded to the Board of Trustees (BOT). When the decision was made not to hire Salaita, Wise did not follow the normal consultative process that Wise has always used. Wise did not contact the Provost and College, but rather contacted Salaita directly. Wise was concerned for Salaita and moving his family. The pressure of time made Wise behave in a way that is not usual. Wise regrets the polarization and division that this has created. Wise addressed a comment in the media that she was influenced by past and future donors in the decision not to hire Salaita. Wise stated that she was absolutely not influenced by donors.

Wise has met with eight or nine colleges; student groups and individual faculty that have asked. They talked about fears for academic freedom and freedom of speech. Units have such differing opinions.

Mallory speculated that there other issues besides the Salaita hiring decision that people are angry about. Mallory did not feel the Salaita issue alone would be enough to upset people this much. Wise responded that there are groups that are not happy with Wise's leadership and there are some that are just unhappy about the Salaita decision.

Graber gave her opinion that a discussion could be held about the Salaita decision at a Senate meeting. Graber expressed her hope that the Senate could act as professionally as SEC has today. Burbules suggested a committee of the whole discussion during a Senate meeting or a special meeting to have these discussions. Lear added that it is not necessarily the decision, but the perception of the decision. Once must be constantly on the march and make sure people do not take the perception as the truth.

5. EP.15.02 Proposal to establish a fully autonomous and accredited College of Medicine at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign in partnership with Carle Health Systems

Chair of the Senate Committee on Educational Policy (EPC) Gay Miller reported that the public hearing for proposal EP.15.02 went well. Questions about the existing College of Medicine and having a good patient base were asked. The questions and answers will appear as part of the final proposal. A broad engagement of our campus is needed. There will be many partnerships, but Carle will be the primary partner. Accreditation is also very important.

Proposal EP.15.02 was approved by EPC today, September 15, and will appear on the September 22 Senate agenda. Pertinent individuals will attend the September 22 Senate meeting to answer any questions. Miller and Adesida fielded questions from SEC members. Both Miller and Adesida reminded SEC members that this proposal is only preliminary and much more work is needed. Governance and Institutional Review Board (IRB) issues are part of ongoing discussions.

6. EP.15.06 Rename the Institute for Genomic Biology as the Carl R. Woese Institute for Genomic Biology

EPC Chair Miller reported that proposal EP.15.06 was approved by EPC and will appear on the September 22 Senate agenda. Miller invited the Director of the Institute for Genomic Biology (IGB), Gene Robinson, to speak about proposal EP.15.05.

IGB had made transformative discoveries and has very large research initiatives. IGB wants to celebrate the past by renaming IGB as the Carl R. Woese Institute for Genomic Biology. Carl R. Woese made the discovery that there is a third domain in life. Modern text books now show that there are three domains of life. This discovery took place at Illinois. Woese's work set the stage for meta-genomics. Proposal EP.15.06 has support from all key stakeholders.

Graber made a motion to support proposal EP.15.06. The motion was seconded and approved unanimously.

7. Update on SEC *ad hoc* Committee on Hiring Decisions

Chair Campbell noted that the charge letter for the SEC ad hoc committee has been drafted. Burbules felt that there was a misperception about the charge of the SEC ad hoc committee, and cited resolution RS.15.03, Senate Resolution on the SEC Resolution on ad hoc Committee Formation. This committee is not going to rewrite the Promotion and Tenure process. Discussion of resolution RS.15.03 followed.

Lear made a motion to postpone discussion of resolution RS.15.03 until agenda item number 10. Setting of the Senate Agenda. The motion was seconded and additional discussion followed. The motion was approved by voice vote.

8. Financial Compensation for Illinois Faculty Who Develop MOOCs

Vice Provost Tucker reported that the MOOC (Massive Open Online Courses) Strategy Advisory Committee (MSAC) have discussed compensation for Illinois faculty who develop MOOCs on the Coursera platform. Faculty members and specialized faculty have been very interested in developing MOOCs without a prearranged agreement for compensation. There is a consistent strategy to develop as much content as possible that is multipurpose for MOOCs, traditional online courses, and in the traditional classroom. The MSAC worked through numerous of policy decisions and reported to the full Senate last fall. Last spring MSAC did benchmarking against peer institutions to identify the level of compensation awarded and also took into consideration what traditional online courses are compensated at Illinois. The committee proposed that compensation be the equivalent of one month's summer salary with a \$12,000 maximum.

Mallory made a motion to refer this issue to the Senate Committee on Faculty and Staff Benefits and request a proposal to be presented to the full Senate.

Tucker noted that compensation funds would be from gift funds, not state funds. Coursera compensates Illinois when a student requests a certificate of completion, but Illinois only receives a small portion and is not a large sum. Coursera is more about exposure than making money. There are 16 or 17 distinct Coursera courses.

Miller seconded the motion to refer this issue to the Benefits Committee. Kindt, Chair of the Benefits Committee, requested a proposal or some type of documentation to present to the Benefits Committee.

Tolliver suggested that the Senate Committee on General University Policy (GUP) might be more appropriate to review compensation for faculty developing MOOCs. Hart suggested that EPC also review compensation for faculty developing MOOCs. The motion was amended to also refer faculty compensation for MOOCs to GUP and EPC. The motion to refer the issue of compensation for faculty developing MOOCs to the Benefits Committee, GUP, and EPC. The motion was approved unanimously.

Lear made a motion to postpone agenda item 12. Executive Session to the October 6 SEC meeting. The motion was seconded and approved by voice.

9. Resolution on Shared Governance, Communication, and Decision-Making

Mallory withdrew this item.

10. Setting of the Senate Agenda

Graber suggested scheduling a special meeting to discuss the Salaita issue. Other SEC members felt that the issue should be discussed at the September 22 Senate meeting with questions and discussion limited per person, and also at the October 13 Annual Meeting of the Faculty.

Graber made a motion to postpone discussion of recent academic freedom issue to the Annual Meeting of the Faculty or a special meeting. Robust discussion followed.

Seymour made a motion to close debate. The motion was defeated. Discussion continued.

Burbules suggested postponing some items to the October Senate agenda to accommodate the desire to discuss the Salaita issue as soon as possible. Graber withdrew her motion to postpone discussion.

Burbules made a motion to leave as much time as possible for discussion, and postpone proposals SP.15.07, RS.15.01, RS.15.02, and RS.15.03 items. The motion was seconded.

Lear made a motion to divide the motion into four motions in order to vote on the postponement of each proposal individually. The motion was seconded and approved by voice.

The motion to postpone SP.15.07 was approved by voice.

The motion to postpone RS.15.01 and refer to the Benefits Committee was defeated; 4 aye, 11 nay. RS.15.01 will appear on the September 22 Senate agenda.

The motion to postpone RS.15.02 and refer to the Senate Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure was approved; 11 aye, 2 nay. O'Brien will write to the proposal sponsors to notify them of the postponement of RS.15.02 to the October 20 Senate meeting.

The motion to postpone RS.15.03 was discussed at length. Seymour made a motion to close debate; 10 aye, 3 nay. Debate was closed. The motion to postpone RS.15.03 failed; 5 yes, 5 no. Proposal RS.15.03 will remain on the September 22 Senate agenda.

Miller made a motion to list proposal EP.15.02 first under "Proposals" on the Senate agenda and list proposal EP.15.06 second. The motion was seconded and approved by voice.

Lear move to set the September 22 Senate agenda as amended. The motion was seconded and approved by voice.

11. New Business

None.

12. Executive Session

The executive session to discuss previous closed sessions was postponed until the October 6, 2014 SEC meeting.

13. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:48 pm.

Jenny Roether
Clerk of the Senate